

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

You're listening to a Mamma Mia podcast.

Mamma Mia acknowledges the traditional owners of land and waters that this podcast is recorded on.

Mamma Mia Out Loud!

Hello and welcome to Mamma Mia Out Loud.

It's what women are actually talking about on Wednesday, the 23rd of August.

I'm Holly Wainwright.

I'm Mia Friedman.

And I'm Claire Stevens.

Thank God.

She's back.

We're back to the threesome that we should rightfully be.

I quite liked the two-hander.

I have to say, I didn't want to give you that feedback because that makes me redundant.

But I thought Monday was excellent.

Thank you, my friend.

But we missed you and I'm glad that you're feeling less poorly.

Thank you.

On today's show, Mia thinks Carrie Bradshaw is a monster and she's not alone in that.

But today we found out that, and just like that, has been renewed for season three,

so we're all going to have to live with Carrie a little bit longer.

I need to unpack it.

Plus, is there a way to have a respectful debate in 2023?

The fate of iconic political show Q&A suggests not.

And do the people who've known you the longest know you the best?

Why were encouraged to cut relationships that represent the old us?

But first, in case you missed it, a new story has pointed to a different kind of problem we're facing in classrooms.

According to the Sydney Morning Herald, a Senate inquiry into disruptive classrooms has been told the story of a teacher who had recently started at a new school and was asked to give one student some improvement strategies.

The child went home and complained.

The principal asked that that teacher apologized to the parents for making that student feel stressed.

Australia's classrooms are ranked among the worst in the world when it comes to discipline and the responsibility for that should not fall solely on teachers.

Education experts have told a federal Senate inquiry into disruptive classrooms.

I think it's us. We're the problem.

Oh, God. Yes.

A report earlier this year said the disciplinary climate in Australia was among the least favorable compared to other member nations while Australian teachers felt less capable when it came to dealing with disruptive students. The inquiry is expected to report its findings by November, but why I found this particularly interesting at the moment

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

is because also in the news this week and now plan results and people love reporting the now plan results in the context of teachers do better. So the now plan results show that one in three school students throughout Australia are not meeting minimum numeracy and literacy expectations and one in 10 are so far behind they need additional support.

What about Children Try Harder?

Children Try Harder.

But it really reminded me that considering this Senate inquiry about discipline in schools, if teachers don't even have the authority to give students improvement strategies, how can we be expecting an environment of rigorous learning?

Do you remember? I don't know if it was like this in the UK hole in Manchester.

Oh, dear.

The cane.

We used to get it.

Oh, my God.

People love to get it, Lord.

I'm not saying bring it back, but I'm just saying look how far we've come.

In our lifetime, we were hit with sticks on our hands and on our bottoms.

And that didn't work.

And our parents were like, meh, I shouldn't have done that.

Oh, my God.

Imagine that.

Look how far the pendulum has swung.

Teachers, every time now plan results come out, teachers get a big whack from the media.

I had breakfast TV on this morning and there was a big whinge about it.

And I'm just like, teachers need medals and crowns.

Much more money because they are dealing with things that no other teachers have had to deal with.

Like my kid goes to a school where they're just all watching TV on their iPad.

You know what I mean?

Like my kid in class.

That didn't happen in my world.

Teachers weren't competing with phones, technology, very, very reduced attention spans.

And also I'm on Team NAPLAN's bullshit anyway.

Love that.

Love that.

Says the person who bought her daughter a cake, sang well done for even going to NAPLAN, which was compulsory.

Year three.

It was announced overnight as Holly mentioned that, and just like that has been renewed for a third season.

So love it or hate it, there's going to be more of it.

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

I have to go on the record and say I was wrong because I openly have said in written posts and on the show that I thought it was done.

I was wrong.

It's a little bit of wishful thinking because I too was hoping that it would wrap up.

But having said that, I will watch every second of every episode.

What's even wrong with us?

I'll never stop.

The season finale drops tomorrow.

And even though many felt and some even hoped, as you say, that this would be a wrap on Carrie, Miranda, Charlotte and the 245 new characters we've met over the past two seasons, the world of Sex and the City will officially live on.

But has Carrie overstayed her welcome?

No.

Is she actually a monster?

No.

And we've just not noticed until now?

No.

Well, I wrote an opinion piece about this for Mama Mia this week.

There's a link in the show notes and it has ignited a passionate debate, which is the kind of debate I can really get behind because it involves imaginary people who wear high heels with their pajamas in their own apartment.

Now, we aren't going to recap last week's episode where Carrie pushed so many people over the edge because we already did that.

We'll put a link in the show notes to our subscriber episode.

But the general gist of my view in my opinion piece and right now in my heart,

is that even though she's always been the main character of the show, her main character energy has really tipped into narcissism.

And look, this is the cardinal sin on this show, being a very bad friend.

Holly disagrees verminly.

Holly defend Carrie.

I think that people have such an issue with Carrie because they don't like child-free women over 50 or 40.

Disagree.

Everybody struggles with the depiction of a woman who has centered herself in her life and everybody else has other people to deal with and take care of. And Carrie lives her life exactly how Carrie wants to and I am bloody here for it.

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

Interesting.

Also, your piece was great and it went nuts  
because lots of people agree.

I know that Carrie is very unpopular.  
She was awful this week.

She was an awful friend to Miranda.

I will put my hand up and say like the not following Miranda  
out of the comedy concert where she got roasted.

She was confused about everything  
and I was confused about why I was fucking her.

I have to go.

Sorry.

Same place.

Sorry.

This is the same place.

Ish.

That'll go in the annals of the bad friend.

But there were other things she did on that that were fine.

Like I relate to her and how complicated it is  
when your friends with your friends X is  
and there's an event and who's going to get there  
and you can't always side with your friend  
and be like you're right.

I'm going to cut him out of my life  
because you cut him out of yours.

That's not real.

But my main thing is that I love that the depiction of Carrie  
is like she's complicated  
and sometimes she does shitty things.

Let her who has never ever done a shitty thing  
throw the stones at Carrie.

I've had times in my life when I haven't been a great friend.

I've had times in my life when I haven't shown up for someone.

In that piece you cherry picked lots of times  
that Carrie had been bad  
and you ignored lots when she'd been good.

Like the time when she was the only one  
who went to Miranda's mum's funeral  
and stood up and walked down the aisle with her  
to support her.

No, they all went.

They all went.

Stood up and went down the aisle with her  
to be there for her.

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

She was there when her children's friends' babies were born.

She's a great friend.

Lots of the time.

I don't know.

Are those things just really obvious,  
basic things you should do for a friend?

Absolutely not.

I remember watching Sex in the City  
and always thinking Carrie was the worst.

No one knows.

Lots of people thought that,  
but that's because she's selfish.

But when you originally watched the show,  
your point about it's because she doesn't have children,  
when I was watching the show,  
all of them didn't have children.

Yeah, but they were all heading for that storyline  
whereas Carrie was like, no.

There are so many instances where Carrie has been awful  
and just thinking about this topic,

I was like, oh yeah.

Remember when Carrie sent Aiden to go and help Miranda  
when she had slipped a disc in her back  
and Miranda was naked on the bathroom floor?

That's a cancelable affair.

That was the point of the show.

It wasn't like, oh, that was fine.

Miranda was really upset about it  
and she called her friend out for a like,  
do you really want to watch a show about people  
who only ever do exactly what they're supposed to do  
and never upset anybody?

I think Carrie Bradshaw is materialistic.

She couldn't afford to put a deposit on her house  
so she made Charlotte sell her ring  
where she had \$40,000 worth of shoes in her apartment.

Misrepresentation of history.

She did not make Charlotte do anything.

She made her feel bloody guilty.

She did what?

She guilted her until she did it.

Oh my God.

She did.

You people are so boring.

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

I think my biggest problem with her  
and that's really interesting what you say about  
the fact that she doesn't have children.  
Or dependents.  
She doesn't even want a cat.  
She has a cat now.  
She has a cat.  
But that's what I mean.  
She didn't even really want a cat.  
We struggle with women like that.  
We don't know what to do with them.  
I don't know because I didn't feel that way  
about Samantha necessarily.  
And I know we haven't seen her in this new iteration  
of the women in their 50s  
so it's probably an unfair comparison.  
To me though,  
I'm the most materialistic, superficial,  
shoes kind of person that exists.  
So that doesn't bother me.  
Neither does the wearing silly clothes.  
I love all that.  
I think I feel that she hasn't grown.  
That she's still the same in her 50s  
as she was in her 30s  
and it's not cute anymore.  
See, I disagree  
because I think in these two seasons  
she's much calmer.  
She gets all the funny lines.  
I think she's great.  
I just,  
I sometimes think I must be watching a different show  
because to me,  
I think she's grown an enormous amount  
through the death of big.  
I think there have been times when all of them  
have been bad friends  
and inverted commas.  
And inverted commas remember at Big's Funeral  
when Charlotte was making it all about herself  
and Carrie had just going to leave it.  
There are times when all of us fail  
the people around us.

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

And I also struggle with the idea  
that we only want to watch stories  
and clearly we don't  
because that's why this show is so iconic  
with people who are perfect.  
Like, I like that Carrie's flawed.  
I like that she doesn't always follow the script.  
I like that she's designed a life  
that works for her.  
Why not?  
I think she fails the people around her a lot  
and in quite painful ways.  
She cheated on Aiden.  
I cheated on people.  
Am I the world's worst person?  
In my history, I have done it.  
Holly Wainwright, no.  
Who hasn't?  
You're not the worst.  
But she cheated on her two big loves,  
Aiden and Big.  
Her not having children,  
I don't mind.  
I know lots and lots of women of that age  
who don't have children.  
But looking at Carrie as some sort of person  
to put on a pedestal  
because her life is exciting  
and that kind of thing,  
which we really did in the 90s and 2000s.  
I'm sort of re-evaluating that  
and thinking that this is a woman  
who has no family.  
She doesn't have to care for anybody.  
It's not funny that she's never referenced parents.  
None.  
She's made one off-hand comment.  
No parents, no siblings.  
Even her friends are all pretty bloody self-sufficient.  
I am looking at a woman  
who it's not about children.  
It's about not caring about anybody else.  
But that's just not true  
because her friends are her everything.

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

This has always been the point of this show.  
You're saying it's not that she doesn't have children  
but subconsciously we're uncomfortable  
with a woman who isn't taking care of anyone,  
whether it's aging parents or children  
or her friends when they need it.  
But I actually think it's unrealistic.  
I think there are many examples over the canon of the show  
when Carrie has turned up for people.  
We're just not picking them out right now  
because the whole point of the show is about friendship.  
And how important it is to her.  
And we can all say yes she did a shitty thing to Seema  
when she forgot about the beach house  
but she was mortified about it.  
I just think when she was outside  
the hairdressers talking to her about it  
when Seema was like, we'll be fine.  
We will.  
I just need some space.  
Carrie was devastated and she said  
I know what happens when you give friendship space.  
But Holly, that's about what Carrie wants,  
not what Seema wants.  
And actually would use that as another example  
of Carrie not being a good friend  
because Seema was saying I need space  
and Carrie was saying I don't want that.  
You're not allowed space.  
But look, I think it's interesting  
and if you remember this whole series  
and the character of Carrie was based on Candice Bushnell  
who wrote the original Sex and the City book  
which was a novel.  
But the character of Carrie Bradshaw  
was deeply unlikeable.  
Not every character has to be likeable, I agree.  
But then when people say  
that was awful,  
you can't then insist  
no, in fact, she is likeable because  
I think she's both, like all of us.  
I think there are some things that she does  
that are very unlikable and flaky



## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

and not great.

And I think there are some things that she does that are brilliant and wonderful, like all of us.

She's complicated.

And I like complicated women in fiction.

I understand.

I just think that we've been sold this idea even to ourselves

that she feels almost sacrilegious to say,

is Carrie a bit of a dick?

And then think about her through this lens

because she's always been sold to us

as everyone wants to be the Carrie

who are you in your first group I'm the Carrie

like the main character,

aspirational, that's who you want to be.

And I think it's been interesting now to go

don't really want to be her life.

Actually that's not who I want to be

because I don't think her life seems

very fulfilling

and so judgmental.

But I would think the same thing about a man.

No you wouldn't.

I think the same thing about big.

I thought he was a monster.

So now we know that the show

is coming back

which I was as I say on the record saying

I don't think it is.

So I was like they're going to leave her on her own

in the apartment with the kitten.

Is that what's going to happen?

No, I don't think so.

It puts a lot less pressure on the last episode

coming back and they obviously knew this

when they wrote it because

you know the writers have to know

whether they have to do a complete

bow around the whole idea

and how are they going to leave Carrie forever

or whether they've got another chance.

So I think that what's going to happen

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

is that Aidan will say I can't come back  
my kids need me.  
I just actually don't really care  
which I'm really surprised at.  
I really don't care.  
I'm not invested in her being with Aidan.  
I'm really invested in her  
and that's a shame.  
I do care and I reckon  
there's something about that last supper.  
There'll be some tension in it.  
I don't know if it'll be like a clear break  
or a clear there together.  
I think there'll be some ambiguity  
to keep us watching for the next season  
but something in that last supper  
whether he says he's not coming back  
and then he turns up for that  
or somebody else turns up.  
I just think that they've made it a big, big moment.  
They love the symbolism of it  
so I just reckon they're going to hone in on it.  
Out Louders will be recapping it, of course,  
as soon as it drops.  
So you'll be able to listen to us talk about that  
on a subscriber episode.  
And just like that  
I realise  
you never know  
Mother Mia Out Loud!  
In 2023,  
can a show  
like the ABC's Q&A  
still exist?  
I ask this question  
because since the original host Tony Jones  
resigned from the show in 2019  
there's been a revolving door of hosts  
many of whom have expressed  
that the amount of personal abuse  
and trolling they have received  
was untenable.  
First, there was hanging out  
with Tony Jones

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

who was untenable.

First, there was Haymish McDonald,  
an experienced journalist who was Jones' replacement.  
He held the hosting role for 18 months  
before stepping down  
and saying that while he didn't go into the job naively  
he was surprised  
by the extreme abuse  
and how it jumped from social media  
into the real world and real life  
so frequently.

So he talked about people coming up to him on the street  
people coming up to him at his home  
and abusing him for things  
like that on the show.

Most recently, Stan Grant resigned  
from the hosting job in May of this year  
citing grotesque racist abuse.

But he went a step further  
and alluded to a far broader problem  
with media.

Here's some of what he said.

Now, Grant has walked away  
from the ABC and the media  
after four decades  
because he wants to change the toxic  
global news culture.

He'll be working out of Monash University  
in a role as Professor  
of Social Media

and he'll be working out of  
Monash University

in a role as Professor  
of Social Media

and he'll be working out of  
Monash University

in a role as Professor of Journalism  
and Director of the Constructive Institute.

He said,

I've been in the crosshairs  
of the worst of our cultural pylons  
and I think we can all learn  
including me, we can all learn  
how to do this better.

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

Of his decision, he said, this is not just  
some sort of abstract idea  
our democracies around the world are in retreat.

The media framing, debate  
and discussion around conflict  
is a cancer on our society  
and the fact that while we the media  
are part of the problem, we have an obligation  
to be part of the solution.

While the huge pylon against  
Grant started when  
he spoke on the ABC about the impact  
of colonialism ahead of King Charles's  
coronation, I don't think  
it's a coincidence that it was during  
his tenure as host of Q&A  
that he decided to quit  
a four decade media career.

Q&A is now being hosted by  
Patricia Cavellis and the future  
show according to some reports  
is uncertain.

I believe that Hamish McDonald, Stan Grant  
and the rotating roster of hosts  
are a symptom of the fact that a show  
like Q&A simply cannot exist  
in 2023.

Public discourse has broken down too much  
we do not know how to engage and disagree  
respectfully anymore and we're too intolerant  
of people with opposing views  
to our own. The complaints  
and the abuse and the demands on a public  
square show like Q&A  
therefore make it entirely  
untenable.

Mia do you think the current cultural moment  
is incompatible with shows like Q&A?

I think that's a really interesting idea  
there's a few things that are very specific to Q&A  
first of all it was  
built not on the back of Twitter  
but the idea of the tweets  
alongside was very much

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

the sort of Greek chorus  
of everybody could have their  
view right and  
that I don't think was good  
I know it was groundbreaking at the time  
and they only just stopped it like  
a couple of weeks ago. That then  
turned it into  
a sort of a gladiatorial  
picker team.

The second thing I think the coincidence  
and it's not a coincidence of  
why the hosts that came after Tony  
Jones were

trolled so mercilessly  
Tony Jones was a straight white man  
the hosts that they've had afterwards  
have been more inclusive  
in terms of Hamish McDonald  
is gay

Stan Grant is an indigenous man  
Patricia Carvelas is a gay woman  
so we know that if you are  
in any group other than a straight  
white man you cop  
it a lot more. You are trolled a lot  
more online and the kind  
of abuse you get is different  
it's much more personal  
it's often much more violent and threatening  
and you feel obviously much  
more threatened by it.

Another thing I was going to say is that the ABC  
has not done itself any favours  
in that it used to have a time slot  
of 9.30 on a Monday night that's when everybody  
watched it. The ABC moved it to Thursday  
and that proved to put it in prime time  
because Four Corners is on an 8.30  
on a Monday so they couldn't move it to Monday  
8.30 so then they decided to move it  
and it became immediately relevant  
everyone had been rusted on  
a little bit like 60 minutes used to be on at 7.30

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

on a Sunday night and was iconic  
in that time slot  
but who knows when it's on now  
and I think that can really erode a brand  
because people just can't find it anymore  
having said all that I think you're completely right  
I think that no one  
wants to change their mind  
anymore and I think that when Q&A  
first started  
that was different. People were more  
open to hearing other people's  
views and I know that we found this  
on the internet is that it's different  
now people don't say I disagree  
with you they say  
you need to delete what you wrote  
or you need to apologise for what you said  
or they will say unfollow  
I can't listen anymore because I disagreed  
with something that you said.  
A hundred percent I think you're absolutely right  
Claire I think that it's  
almost cute to think about  
what Q&A used to be  
when on a Monday night it set the agenda  
for the week the news agenda for the week  
it had its hashtag quanda  
it was like join the conversation  
it's almost cute to think about that now  
because that conversation  
is such a toxic  
mire of yelling and hatred  
that it's actually  
so depressing to see what has happened  
during that time and I think  
that it is as you say me  
people don't want to change their minds  
but more than that they don't want to  
tolerate listening or  
seeing a person who  
puts forward a different  
position and look  
I understand that

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

so it feels dangerous  
in times of big debates  
to be presenting the other  
side of an issue  
like the voice right or like  
marriage equality at the time  
and there are lots of very valid arguments  
about platforming people  
who are arguing about human rights issues  
is it's really  
thorny but on the other hand  
the level of expectation  
that you say just interrupt for one second  
you say the other side  
the people on that side think  
that you're the other side right  
so it goes both ways  
so say the marriage equality debate  
there are plenty of people  
in the LGBTQI plus community  
who believe that  
giving a platform to people  
who were arguing against their right  
to be married just gave a free pass  
to a whole lot of bigots who were debating  
their basic human rights  
and whether or not they had a right to love  
in the same way that straight people did  
was that helpful?  
Well you'd have to say the government shouldn't have put it to a referendum  
like that's not the fault of Q&A necessarily  
no no no it's not the front of Q&A  
but what I mean is  
those kind of examples and massive cultural moments  
the idea of like  
showing both sides  
is tarnished and tricky  
like what I'm saying is I understand the argument  
about not platforming views  
that can be co-opted in hate  
right I totally understand that  
or in misinformation like anti-vaxxers  
100% so you're like we've got a COVID debate  
do we have to have

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

the person there who's saying the vaccine is invented by Bill Gates and they're trying to control us all  
so I understand the limitations of free speech and I understand all those concerns but for example this week on Q&A and the viewership has plummeted a really long way  
they had their lowest ever viewership fair enough it was up against a Matilda's game or something a couple of weeks ago when they barely got 100,000 people in five cities to watch that show which is amazing it used to be newsmaking exactly now nobody even knows it's on but this Monday just gone Tina Arena was on as a musical guest so she wasn't sitting on the panel I think they started doing this when Stan Grant was presenting they often would finish with the song I actually really liked it yeah me too on Monday's show they finished with a song from Tina Arena she was not there to give any opinions or whatever but of course a storm erupts or at least the media report that a storm erupts because Q&A is platforming Tina Arena who during the Covid lockdowns was critical of Dan Andrews' Victorian Government and who has been a supporter in the past of Scott Morrison so it's like oh Q&A platforming Scott Morrison's mould you know like oh my god and you're like she's just there to sing a song Patricia Cavill is just literally at the end throw story and goes and Tina Arena is here with her new song Blah and so if platforming people has become so fraught I mean I spoke on Friday about this around Kitchen Cabinet and Annabelle Crabb and last night she had Peter Dutton on like it is so fraught



## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

to say I want to talk to this person  
this person is on my TV screen  
without it being an endorsement of everything  
they've ever said and everything they've ever thought  
and we're definitely I mean  
I just think that it is actually  
impossible for a show like Q&A  
to exist in the way that it did  
six years ago and that's actually  
really sad because I remember  
watching it and seeing like  
it could be a really hot button  
political issue I agree  
there are certain ones that they never  
touched like Vax  
stuff now  
it feels like it has  
to be somewhat  
safe in order to  
go to air I think the other  
thing that's made it really hard is identity  
politics and having  
a gay man  
or an indigenous man as the host  
means nobody can possibly see them  
as objective because  
it's like oh well you're going to sympathize  
with the left because I just  
assumed that that's what political party  
you align with because of your identity  
and in both cases  
both Hamish McDonald and Stan Grant are  
excellent journalists who do not have  
predictable perspectives on anything  
and were actually very good at  
moderating debate but I think  
the other thing I've noticed in clips  
that I've seen of Q&A over  
the last few months is that  
the tenets of disagreeing  
respectfully don't make  
for the entertainment we're demanding  
which is kind of what Stan  
Grant is saying right when he says that the

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

media has a part to play in this because  
we only really want to report on Q&A  
if people are throwing shoes  
and yelling at each other. Exactly we want  
contempt we want anger  
and in order to win the audience  
you do have to make things personal  
you do have to call people names  
you have to talk over people  
you have to make it about your own  
lived experiences you have to  
use I which often  
is something that if you're teaching somebody  
how to disagree respectfully it's not just  
using your own personal experience  
you do have to put down other people's beliefs  
and if you listen you're seen  
as being complicit. Literally if you were  
teaching a child how to disagree respectfully  
all of those things  
do not translate into television  
in 2023 which is such a shame  
are we just addicted and programmed by all  
our algorithms as we know for extremity  
is it just boring if people are  
sitting there debating politics and political  
issues and they're not trading insults  
and so therefore it's not good TV  
yeah I think that  
they've also been hamstrung  
by the nature of the show  
has meant that fewer and fewer people have wanted  
to go on it so you know  
I've been on it a couple of times but a long time ago  
I said I was never going to go do it  
again because it's just like there's nothing  
to be gained there's only stuff to be lost  
which is awkward because  
because our favourite person  
in the world, Jesse Steven  
is going to be on it on Monday  
I'm sure there'll be something to be gained from him  
but anyway go on  
well good luck Jesse

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

seriously good luck Jesse  
she'll be able to handle it  
she's incredibly careful and well  
considered and has  
less  
impulse control issues than me  
correct obviously I don't do any more live TV  
any more because it's the worst format for me  
but when the producer  
said to me that every time she approaches  
a woman the woman says no  
and then suggests another woman  
whereas she said the men never say no  
the men say yes not all the men say yes  
I think now more and more people  
who just have moderate  
views don't want to go on the show  
because if you have a moderate  
view you are attacked by both sides  
and so you end up  
with a show full of people  
with more extreme views  
who want to go on grandstand and virtue signal  
to their tribe on social media  
and also are looking for claps  
from the audience we have a joke  
me and a friend when we watch it  
about how all you have to do is say  
we should do more and everyone claps  
like about any issue  
we should do more and then that'll make everybody clap  
and it's just it means nothing  
I think the other thing is  
the questions that people ask  
have become  
laden in contempt  
you're asking something to somebody  
and you're angry at them when you're asking them  
and you're also asking  
often times  
impossible questions  
I feel like it's times just come  
it's been nice  
I agree but the reason I think it's sad

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

is because I think public debate is really important  
and it doesn't even have to be debate  
I don't even want to frame it in like  
so somebody wins and somebody loses  
100% but one of the things that people  
always tell us that they like about our show  
not to be all back patty about this  
is that we can disagree  
without it becoming toxic  
and I think that that is something  
that people actually do want  
I don't think it's that they don't want it  
I think if you frame everything  
as a competition and a debate  
it becomes too tricky to actually  
make any changes and I just think  
it's a shame that that show is dying  
in lots of ways because  
there's information from all the same old idiots  
on the internet or us of course  
different idiots  
who are clearly not idiots  
that is an outrageous comment  
I just said you might  
you might need a bit of cleaning of your ears  
because I just said  
I can go on and on and on  
we know  
if you want to make mum Mia  
out loud part of your routine  
five days a week  
we release segments on Tuesdays and Thursdays  
just for mum Mia subscribers  
to get full access  
follow the link in the show notes  
and a big thank you to all our current subscribers  
do the people who've known you longest  
know you best  
I read a remarkable advice column this week  
where a woman had asked a question about her obligations  
to be a good daughter to her mother  
even as her mother's actions were  
in her view, thoughtless and selfish  
and the advice columnist Catherine Jesemorton

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

wrote some wise advice  
about actions you can forgive and those you can't  
but then she wrote more broadly  
about how culturally we're being encouraged  
towards eliminating relationships  
that no longer serve us  
and I'm using that a little bit in quotes  
because that's a phrase you hear a lot  
or who we want to be  
whether they're our friendships or our family  
let me read you a bit that really made me think  
she said  
it's easy to forget in the midst of coping  
with flaws that it's rare and important  
to be known by someone for your whole life  
I sometimes wonder  
if all our lifelong journeys of entrepreneurial  
self-improvement  
are making it too easy to lose sight  
of the pleasure of being intensively  
known by someone  
our culture's emphasis on self-improvement  
whether it's through wellness or professional  
accomplishment or whatever  
suggests that our old selves weren't  
worth knowing anyway  
we're looking for the people who will celebrate  
our future selves, not our past selves  
and we move through life banishing  
the past in a flurry of insistence  
that we have no regrets  
I was also really thinking  
about this advice in terms of siblings  
because Claire had brought  
an article that you really wanted to discuss  
about the longest relationship  
of our lives and I was like  
oh I don't know if that's true  
so we've been discussing it  
we asked some of the mum and me a team  
what their relationships with their siblings are like  
in my family I am  
10 years older than my siblings who are twins  
growing up

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

because it was such a big difference  
we didn't really have anything in common ever  
when it became a teenager  
that gap became a lot more obvious  
it was really hard for me to build a relationship  
with a teenage boy  
yeah we just never saw eye to eye  
and didn't have too much to do with each other  
and I hope that that bridge will close  
as we get older  
I have a twin brother, we've both been really close  
growing up we went to the same primary school  
but obviously being twins we do have  
that competitive side that takes over  
every now and then  
we're both now 23  
so we do butt heads because we are still  
living at home and sharing a car in a bathroom  
but he is  
someone that I run to first for advice  
and I know that I'm the same for him  
and I think we just have an extra close bond  
because we are twins  
and we've gone through every stage of life together  
biologically  
I'm the girl in the middle of two brothers  
but my stepsister is my best friend  
we've been in each other's lives  
for 26 years and while we used to  
absolutely hate each other growing up  
we're best friends now  
I've always thought there's something magical  
about the connection you have  
with your siblings or for those who don't have siblings  
cousins or family  
friends or just those people that you've known  
for most if not all of your life  
and for a lot of people  
sibling bonds are the longest  
relationships of our lives  
we know siblings before we meet  
our partners and we'll  
know them after our parents die  
what I loved about

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

the article I read this week which is called  
the longest relationships of our lives  
in the Atlantic was it talked about  
this idea and it's what the  
advice columnist  
touches on a little bit  
this idea of  
dynamic re-centering  
which the author Angela  
Chen defines as the process of siblings  
coming together later in life  
to evaluate and re-write  
their bond and often  
it can be triggered by an external event  
like the death of a parent or pregnancy  
or birth and so on what does that mean  
like they come together and re-establish  
a new relationship as  
adults without the baggage of their  
childhood relationship yes  
and I  
reckon there are a lot of siblings  
who don't know that you  
can do that that you can  
redefine your relationship  
but a lot of people notice it  
across the lifespan  
I think it's very hard to  
redefine any familial relationships  
like parent, child  
siblings  
one of the things that can be quite funny  
when you're an adult and  
you might have a family of your own  
but then when you're  
back with your family of origin  
you regress and you become  
someone that your partner or even your  
children doesn't recognise  
because you have a certain role in your family  
of origin that's obviously different  
to the role that you take in your  
relationship or in your family that you've had  
if you have

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

a really prescriptive way  
of defining a particular  
relationship with your mum or your dad  
or your siblings  
I think it's often going to fall short  
and there's going to be those tensions  
where you go back into it and  
you feel like you regress so many people I know  
and I feel it as well go back to my childhood  
home and start doing things  
that I'm like what the hell where did  
teenage Claire come from the ghost of teenage Claire  
it's mostly becoming petulant I find  
but I  
spoke on this podcast about being scared  
about Jesse having a baby because our  
relationship would change  
but our relationship has never been  
as close and uncomplicated  
as it is right now  
there's something about  
a major life moment  
that allows for that dynamic  
re-centering  
where you're just focused on something  
different and you're playing different roles  
and you can kind of leave behind  
any tensions  
and I think perhaps maybe  
former generations  
were better at doing this  
you just kind of accepted that things were fluid  
over the lifespan whereas  
now that we're very  
into toxic family  
members and people who don't serve us  
and people holding us back  
setting boundaries, cutting people off  
yes we look at people  
and think that we can just let them go  
by the wayside when there actually is  
something incredibly beautiful  
about having a lifelong relationship  
with someone that changes



## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

over the course of your lifespan  
Holly I feel like you feel  
differently about this  
I just have a different relationship  
with my family and I think that  
both of you  
have very close relationships  
with your family  
they're very very central to your life  
right  
whereas I probably represent a different group of people  
who I love my family  
I have to obviously put that disclaimer up in front  
like I really really adore them  
I wouldn't argue that they know me best  
so I have a brother and I love him  
but we have not lived in the same city  
since I was 19  
nearly every big event that's happened in my  
adult life and all the things that have happened  
to me and the same for him has happened  
out of sight and same for him  
so we love each other  
and we know each other very well  
because obviously we share parents and we lived in the same house  
and we know the childhood  
version of Holly and Tom really well  
but his old friends would know him  
better than I do his former partners  
would know him better than I do  
his kids would know him better than I do  
do you know what I mean like I think  
that it's not  
necessarily true that for everybody  
it's somebody who knows you  
excellently and I do know that for some people  
and this isn't necessarily true for me because my brother  
is awesome but I know for some people  
there is a real  
problem and tension with always being  
categorized as the person you used to be  
especially if you've made a lot of work  
put in a lot of effort to try  
and change certain things about yourself

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

it can be and I hate  
to use the word because I know everybody hates it  
but it can be really toxic to  
walk back into a house or back into a relationship  
with someone who refuses to see you  
as anything other than who you once were  
and that can be  
little diggly things like  
oh as if you like exercise because you  
are shit at PE at school  
or it can be big things like  
a way you might react to a big emotional moment  
that you've actually  
really struggled to reprogram how you're going to do that  
but they're going to be like of course you're going to be upset about that  
or of course you're going to think this  
like that can actually be really  
limiting and difficult for people  
so the idea of cutting off all relationships  
with people who don't serve us  
has become a little bit aspirational  
that you should only have people in your life  
at all times who are like  
your greatest cheerleaders  
and who think you're amazing  
and who are useful to you in some way  
on your self-improvement journey  
I don't like that, that's bullshit  
but I also really respect and understand  
people who do not want to be held back  
by  
family or old friends who have an  
old outdated version of them  
stuck in their head. I think it can be both  
because I felt  
the significance of the sibling bond  
recently when my mum lost two of her brothers  
in a relatively short period of time  
and speaking to her one night  
we were kind of trying to  
unpack her grief because obviously  
she was grieving for her brothers  
and their families and their futures  
but she was also grieving

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

for the living part  
of her and her family's history  
that had gone with them  
so there's a line  
in the siblings article that says  
siblings are a form of memory that lives outside ourselves  
and so for you  
Tom  
is the only person who holds  
the memory of your childhood that isn't you  
and so there's something  
really special  
and profound about that  
that obviously coexist  
with all the frustrations  
of being a sibling  
but that is also  
quite similar to what the  
advice article said about  
considering a relationship with somebody  
in life and considering a relationship  
with them after they've died  
which really struck a chord with you  
Absolutely, I mean I think  
it's interesting because  
having said all I've said about my  
relationship with my brother last year  
I went back to England by myself  
for the first time since I've had kids  
and my parents weren't there  
which was also for the first time in a long time  
they were on holiday so my brother  
and I got to spend time together as adults  
in a way that we have actually never done  
like ever done  
it was amazing, it was great  
because we live in different countries  
if we're together it's because of the whole family's together  
and my parents are the social directors  
of that relationship  
or we'll go over to Tom's for dinner  
we'll all go here, we'll all do that  
me and my brother have never had  
a dependent established relationship as adults

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

really, like that's familial  
because we don't live in the same place  
So was it like getting to know...  
It was great because it was stranger  
Really, well no, I'm not arguing that  
we don't know each other at all, of course we do  
and it was great  
because I can see  
all these familiar family traits  
in him and me and my parents  
and we're all like the messy mess  
like we all are and like of course that's what's happening  
and we also of course are deeply  
bonded by our parents  
and what's going on with them and all of those things  
and it was actually amazing and I loved it  
and it made me really question  
what our relationship  
will be like when our parents aren't there anymore  
because it would actually be  
really easy for it to disappear  
for it to disintegrate  
because he's  
a man who's not going to call me  
every five minutes like he's not that guy  
we've been talking a lot during the World Cup  
on our whatsapp family whatsapp  
it would actually be quite easy  
to let that relationship almost entirely  
disappear and that would be terrible  
because it is as you say, living history  
and obviously his kids are part of  
and all those things  
I think for me that experience isn't frustrating  
it's got some poignancy to it  
but I do have people in my life  
for whom it is really frustrating  
where they walk back into their family  
and they're immediately put in quite a  
negative  
frustrating position because they're not allowed  
to see who they've become  
outside of the family  
but it could redefine your relationship

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

that whole kind of  
de-centering could happen  
once your parents are gone  
because your sibling is the only person  
who understands  
and a lot of people say that  
there's a bonding that happens  
because there is only one person  
who can stand there and understand  
exactly how you feel  
and all the complicated emotions  
Matilda's fans  
which is everybody, I have a recommendation  
and it's a special bonus episode  
of No Filter, we're dropping tomorrow with Mackenzie Arnold  
I'm so excited  
I did her only podcast interview in Australia  
she's about to leave, I think today  
she leaves to go back to  
England where she plays for West Ham  
what is West Ham?  
It's a London football team  
West Ham is a London football team  
so lots of Matilda's play in England  
some of them quite a few play in my hometown of Manchester  
but lots of them play in London including Sam Currie  
plays for Chelsea and obviously Mackenzie  
who plays for West Ham  
she's the goalie if anyone's wondering  
she's the Australian Defence Minister  
I'm so excited, was she great?  
she was great  
I wish she'd come in, I would have all cuddled her though  
and it would have been uncomfortable  
embarrassing, I nerded out  
and asked all my questions like  
when we see you getting off the bus  
you've all got your headphones in  
what are you listening to?  
I actually am quite different  
I listen to a bit of country  
I like just chilling out  
I don't like to be stuffed in my ear  
it sort of gets me going a bit too early

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

you still have at least an hour  
it is when we get into the changing before we head out to Warmer  
I asked her about Nervous Wheeze  
I asked her about  
pre-game rituals and post-game rituals  
I asked her about all of those things  
I display my appalling knowledge of  
soccer, I apologise profusely  
for not knowing the rules better  
I made up for it with my enthusiasm  
out loud as if you want to listen to that interview with Mackenzie Arnold  
there will be a link in the show notes  
if you're looking for something else  
to listen to, on yesterday's  
subscriber episode  
we released a special Ask Me Anything  
by we, it was me and Holly  
because you were not here  
so we sold it on  
it was, where Holly and Mia spoke about  
how they cope with imposter syndrome  
and share a unique insight into their friendship  
and how they manage it at work  
I'm personally really excited to listen to this one  
I haven't listened to it yet  
and I'm really keen to see  
what the dynamic between you guys was like  
when it was a bit more private  
I'm so keen  
I know we were quite honest about things  
it was really weird us being in the studio talking to each other like that  
just felt like us being out for dinner  
I quite loved it  
there's a link in the show notes if you want to listen to that now  
thank you for listening to Australia's number one  
news and pop culture show  
this episode was produced by Emily Incazillas  
Blackman with audio production  
from Leah Porges  
we'll see you tomorrow  
bye  
shout out to any Mamma Mia subscribers listening  
if you love the show  
and want to support us as well

## [Transcript] Mamamia Out Loud / How Carrie Bradshaw Became A Monster

subscribing to Mamma Mia is the very best way to do so  
there is a link in the episode description